

**FIRST MINISTER'S ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS
5/6 DECEMBER 2017 – EDINBURGH
SUMMARY NOTES**

COUNCIL MEMBERS

- Amina Ahmed – Scottish Government Fairer Future Codesign Panel (plus support)
- Kara Brown, Lead Young Women's Engagement, World YWCA
- Tressa Burke, CEO, Glasgow Disability Alliance
- Catherine Calderwood MA Cantab. MBChB FRCOG FRCP Edin, Chief Medical Officer
- Vicky Featherstone, Artistic Director, London's Royal Court Theatre - apologies
- Jacqui Ferguson, Non-Executive Director at Wood
- Professor Anne Glover, President Elect, Edinburgh University - apologies
- Katie Horsburgh, Girlguiding Scotland (plus support)
- Baroness Kennedy of the Shaws, QC – 6th only
- Louise Macdonald OBE, Independent Chair and CEO, Young Scot
- Satwat Rehman, CEO One Parent Families Scotland
- Emma Ritch, Executive Director, Engender
- Suki Wan, Vice Chair, Scottish Youth Parliament – 5th only
- Talat Yaqoob, Director, Equate Scotland and Co-Founder, Women 5050

- Deborah Gallagher, Scottish Government - secretariat/support to the Chair
- Charlotte Liddell – First Minister's Mentee – shadowing the Chair

**FIRST MINISTER'S ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS
PRE-EVENT WORKING DINNER
5 DEC 2018 - THE OUT OF THE BLUE DRILL HALL - EDINBURGH**

Members attended a pre-event working dinner the night before the inaugural meeting, which was their first formal face-to-face gathering as the First Minister's Advisory Council on Women and Girls (the Council).

After the Chair of the Council opened proceedings, personal hopes going forward and a favourite tune was the ice breaker that accompanied general introductions. There was a lot of energy in the room and a lively and positive discussion followed. Council members had lots of interesting ideas – some of the questions and points made:

- Do we need to align to the FM's agenda and if we strayed from this, would there be any implications?
- Would be good to call on relevant people when topics are being explored – will there be an option to do this?
- Hope that we take this forward in a holistic manner – too many groups/work areas/etc. work in silos.

- Would like an emphasis on good coherent work/processes, with the right people in the room
- Interested in agreeing what the short/medium/long term focus will be, and what our quick wins could be.
- Our Circle is powerful – influencing society is how we change culture and we need to work with our Circle strategically.

As the Council's deliverable is an end of year report to the First Minister, time was also spent discussing this. The Council explored various presentation ideas, including RAG rating Scottish position/other countries positions/attitudes/improvements. It was thought that this could present a full multi-layered joined up and coherent position and would be worth exploring further as we go forward.

The order of the next day was discussed before the Chair opened the floor for AOB. A short discussion around general members communications followed along with the impressive Circle membership so far.

The Chair then brought the formal proceedings to close and gifted all members with Empowerment Pants, purchased from the social enterprise MsMissMrs - <https://www.msmissmrs.co.uk/empowerment-pants> (Council members not present for these first meetings will receive theirs by post).

Note: The Out of the Blue Drill Hall is a community venue in Leith and catering was supplied by the social enterprise Punjabi Junction – part of the Sikh Sanjong women's group.

THE FIRST MINISTER'S ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WOMEN AND GIRLS INAUGURAL MEETING

6 DECEMBER 2017 – 10-16:30 - MANSFIELD TRAQUAIR CENTRE - EDINBURGH

The inaugural meeting of the First Minister's Advisory Council on women and Girls was held in the Mansfield Traquair Centre, the church lovingly restored by the Mansfield Traquair Trust - which included the restoration of the world-famous murals painted by Phoebe Anna Traquair. The day was split into three sessions.

SESSION ONE

The Chair of the Council opened proceedings and discussed what an honour it was to be asked by the First Minister to lead this movement. The Chair took forward introductions of Council members to the First Minister, which included a few words about their own hopes and aspirations. Following the welcome and introductions the First Minister shared her own inspiration and wisdom and spoke to the Council about why she felt this group was needed and what her aspirations were for the Council going forward. She began by stating quite clearly that she didn't want it to be just a talking shop.

First Minister explained that she was looking for lasting change, reflecting on a personal example and referring to a point one of the young women had made during the introduction, about her not wanting this to be an issue when she reached adulthood. It was acknowledged that this was a generational opportunity and that it was her ambition for gender inequality to become a historic curiosity. First Minister reflected on her own struggles over time and pointed out the fact that there are even more pressures on young girls today, given the digital world we live in.

First Minister finished by discussing that it was her belief that we are in a special moment in history, advising the Council to be bold – acknowledging that she fully expected to be made to feel uncomfortable from time to time with the findings of the Council – and that that was ok!

There then followed a lively discussion which included:

- The enormity, complexity and urgency of this movement.
- How this was an opportune moment in time.
- The importance of effective planning and strategy to ensure long lasting, effective change, particularly as shifting social norms was required.
- How we have a good track record with Scotland leading the way on so many agendas in the past (including zero tolerance, trafficking, women in prison).
- What inequality looks like and on the flip side, what equality would look like (and how this would be different for different ages).
- The importance of including men and boys.
- Making connections and how this work would fit into the wider context (Sustainable Development Goals/United Nations, etc.).
- Ensuring the young voice of Scotland is heard, as they are often the most silenced.

- How equality isn't instinctive so needs to be built into systems, education, training, dialogue, policy making.
- As well as acknowledging that an intersectional approach was required, it was noted that particular effort should be made to reach people who do not usually engage, to engage with women's real lived experience and to improve women's everyday lives.

There followed a break during which time registration opened for the Circle event and First Minister departed.

SESSION TWO

The Council Chair, Louise Macdonald OBE, opened the afternoon session in - 100 people from across all sectors who had accepted membership to the Circle joined us (many couldn't meet us on the day but expressed their interest in being a member).

She welcomed everybody and set the context of the current climate of inequality, reflected on the morning's session with the First Minister and spoke about how she was honoured to be leading this movement - and finished by explaining how the afternoon would unfold, before opening the networking lunch.

Following lunch table discussions explored the three questions which had been previously provided with papers for the event – below is a summary and a full write up is at Annex A.

1. What are the systemic factors that are barriers to achieving gender equality?

Broadly speaking the responses fell into these categories:

- *Culture*
- *Media*
- *Finance/financial dependence on men*
- *Education*
- *Equality work/policy*
- *Long term planning required*
- *Gender based violence*
- *Systems/legislation*
- *Representation of women*

2. What three priority strategic/system level issues should the council focus on in year one?

The responses to this question were varied – some focused on high level and others on a specific issues. Full notes in Annex A, but a summary is below:

- *The Council to be leaders – and be bold*
- *Awareness – from general public to business and government over the issue*
- *Education was another key area*

- *Financial dependence on men*
- *Workforce*

3. What does success look like?

- *50/50 – gender balance/ parity in: Local and national government, school subjects, business, boards, and across all levels. End to occupational and school subject segregation.*
- *Shift in the behaviours, career choices, attitudes of men and change in societal expectation of men.*
- *Reduction in/closing of the gender pay gap*
- *Shift in what work/roles society values – more men taking shared parental leave.*
- *Identify, championing and recording of good employers/organisations – who offer flexible working, shared parental leave, balanced work force, balanced board/senior management.*
- *Engagement with all of society*
- *Reduction in the number of women (and their children) in poverty*
- *Gender auditing*

Louise Macdonald addressed Circle members again and thanked them for their valuable contributions, advised that they would receive feedback asap (probably early new year), advised that a digital platform was under construction and via this we will participate widely and provide a function to increase membership of the Circle. She finished by advising that we were hoping to hold the next meeting in March 2018.

A short break followed while the Circle members left, after which the Council reconvened.

SESSION THREE

The Chair welcomed Council members back and remarked about the vibrant discussions that she'd observed. As initial high level analysis was being taken forward on the table discussions Council members discussed what they had observed, which fell into the following categories:

Data

- *Views that we have lots of data.*
- *Also views that data is missing in many areas.*
- *Suggestion of a gender audit.*
- *Questions about why change is so slow or not happening when we have data that tells us there's a problem.*
- *Many people not aware of the existence of data or of Government policies and strategies.*

Accountability

- *Where does responsibility lie for making change happen.*
- *Where does the power lie.*
- *And how can those who have responsibility or hold power be held accountable for their decisions and actions.*
- *Where does accountability lie on a complex issue like changing culture or changing social attitudes?*
- *Inclusion of women in decision making.*

Young people

- *Focus on young people and what's expected of them.*
- *Focus on education must be early.*
- *Teacher training needs to address gender equality and stereotyping.*
- *In relation to education remember that teachers themselves live in the same culture of sexual harassment and gender stereotyping.*
- *Speak to primary school children if we want to know what's important for them.*

Poverty

- *Financial independence and financial autonomy are particular issues for women.*
- *Poverty and the 'extra cost' of being a women need to addressed.*
- *Women can experience, for example, period poverty and extra transport costs.*
- *Connections to new social security powers should be explored.*

Attitudes

- *Need to challenge and change gender stereotyping, sexism, misogyny and harassment.*
- *Men need to be helped to understand that they too will benefit from gender equality.*
- *Challenge of measuring cultural changes.*

Workplace

- *The gendered nature of some types of work remains a problem, partly because of different approaches to pay.*
- *The working environment as a place where harassment occurs.*
- *Public and private sectors need to learn from each other.*
- *Importance of childcare.*
- *Equal pay.*

Intersectionality

- *Must ensure that trans women are included.*
- *Need to ensure greater diversity and inclusion of disabled people.*

Systems

- *Systems failure when it comes to women. Systems created in the past were created by men, with men in mind, modelled around a man's perspective. Does there needs to be a systems redesign?*

There then followed a wide ranging discussion, exploring how we might settle on priority issues for 2018. Key points included:

- The role of the Council is to give advice - it doesn't need to work out the details of how things should be done.
- Whether we should apply a single question across each theme? For example – “how would we design systems now if we were designing with women in mind. What would be different”. The Chair also made the point that work could be commissioned on any of this to help to get the thinking right.
- Balance between being ambitious and not being too complex or trying to do too much.
- Can we think of what we're doing as a campaign – attitudinal change across workplace, schools, public life etc? Campaign and attitude change needs complex and sophisticated approach.
- Need to educate girls on their rights so they know what to expect and to ask for.
- If we do have a number of themes, question across themes could be:
 - Who is accountable?
 - Do we have data and how is it used?
- The Extra Cost Commission looked at disability, could it look at gender?
- Remember we have a Poverty Commission and don't want to overlap with it.
- Could the Council have role in seeing and making connections across Government?
- Could it give advice to FM on how to integrate gender equality within SG systems and structures?

- What would be the best approach – challenging attitudes, challenging assumptions, challenging expectations? Challenge throughout life from school to old age, and across different characteristics?

Louise Macdonald then offered to synthesise our discussions and pull together a draft document, proposing a way forward, for the Council to agree. It was agreed this would be a helpful next step.

Louise Macdonald also underscored the requirement to move quickly to reach agreement – given timescales and the urgency of the task.

The following actions were agreed:

1. The draft Terms of Reference for the Council – any final feedback by cop 15th December 2017 so we can sign off.
2. Louise Macdonald will work with secretariat to “draw” the ideas/models we discussed that we can then all feedback on a synthesised version to help us agree our first batch of three topics for 2018.
3. Notes from our meeting – these will be written up and circulated.
4. Notes from the Circle “World Café” discussions – these will be written up and circulated.
5. We will establish a BaseCamp Group (using Basecamp 3) for shared collaborative working.
6. We will also set up a Council WhatsApp group – more for informal news; highlights or sharing interesting topics.
7. We will circulate provisional dates for our 2018 meetings – noting that we do wish to have our next meeting on or around IWD in March 2018.
8. We will keep everyone posted re outstanding invitations to join the Council and advise accordingly.
9. The procurement for comms/digital/campaign for the Council is currently progressing through the SG system.

The meeting closed at 16:30.

NACW&G
December 2017

NOTES FROM THE CIRCLE TABLE DISCUSSION SHEETS

1. What are the systemic factors that are barriers to achieving gender equality?

Culture

We need a better explanation of gender inequality, what it means, what it looks like, what it feels like and why it's a problem. Communication gap. There are still many people that still need to be convinced that there is a problem. Lack of awareness.

Framing – we are all human beings, equal society will benefit everyone, feminism isn't an attack on men (but this is how it is often perceived)

- Expectations of men and women – value (or undervaluing) of jobs/roles traditionally done by women
- Harmful and outdated gender roles that persist
- Gender norms are so embedded that opinion often beats research/fact
- Persistent imbalance of power
- Traditional views and expectations, stereotyping (pink & blue)
- Unconscious bias
- Influence of history and religion – religious orgs. Exempt from equality legislation
- 'that's the way it is and always has been' – attitudes that are difficult to challenge
- Toxic masculinity

Media

- Power of the media
- Media/commercial products – damaging and seeming to get worse in gendering products/sexism
- Lack of female representation
- Portrayal of women in the media
- Exclusion – women often not represented/isolated as lacking in digital skills

Finance

- Poverty for women
- Impact of low wages and benefit system on women
- Cost of being a woman – period poverty
- Lack of affordable childcare/flexi working and still fact that women are expected to take the lead caring

- Gender to be considered in budgeting/financial decisions
- Lack of affordable transport

Education

- Need to improve/increase equality education across all areas (schools, employment etc)
- Confusion/misunderstanding of gender and sex
- Gender/intersectionality should be a core part of teacher training and re-training

Equality work/policy

- Work is often in silos
- Equality policy and legislation not adequately enforced
- Themes/priorities/budgets in silos
- Gender equality should be included in national goals/targets/indicators

Long Term

- Change requires long-term commitment – 4 year political system hinders ability for long term planning/funding/action
- Short term funding hinders progress and ability to plan long term
- Good practise isn't embedded long term

Gender Based Violence

- GBV including prostitution is a barrier
- Invisibility of men who are perpetrators
- Justice system – crime centred not person centred

Systems/Legislation

- Patriarchal systems and legislation in place – designed without regard for women/women's needs
- Systems aren't accountable enough – if there are system failures who can this be reported to?

Representation of Women

- Lack of women in positions of power
- Not enough role models
- Diverse voices not heard

2. What three priority strategic/system level issues should the council focus on in year one?

1. Equality Outcomes
 2. Tackling attitudes and beliefs (research/baseline research)
 3. Implementation of existing good policy
-
1. Commercial Sexual Exploitation
 2. Council to be bold and visible and lead the charge for gender equality in the country
 3. Strengthen the equality duty
-
1. Campaign – calling out sexism/high profile – to generate debate and drive cultural change
 2. Education
 3. Dialogue with the media
-
1. Tackling poverty/economic inequality
 2. Cultural influence – drive social change
 3. Women and girls voices to be heard in all spaces
-
1. Financial security – address pay gap, occupational segregation etc
 2. Equality and inclusion in education
 3. Promoting role models/mentoring/representation of women in all sectors
-
1. Childcare/early years education – improve pay and status of this work
 2. Gender equality mainstreamed
 3. High profile marketing and comms campaign to support this
-
1. National approach to consent, relationships, equality teaching across education (early years to tertiary education)
 2. Ensuring childcare is a well-paid, highly valued profession
 3. Focus on sexual harassment – creating a culture of belief
-
1. Awareness raising – social media, link to current/existing campaigns
 2. Gender equality budgeting (and push for strong adherence to existing equality legislation)
 3. Positive action – promotion of apprenticeships, mentoring, paid internships
-
1. Gender based violence (focus on sexual harassment – campaign)
 2. Health and well-being (mental health, pregnancy and maternal health, disability)
 3. Tackling poverty – disproportionate effect on women
-
1. Engage with and include men and boys
 2. Creation of a women's trade union
 3. Use a successful feature of Stonewall's work - 'straight allies', the idea that straight men and women were needed as a powerful voice alongside gay people's own voice. Are 'male allies' needed - not because women are incapable of leading the change themselves, but because if you want all of society to change you need to

think about how you engage all of society (and not make some of those you wish to change 'the enemy').

- switch focus to men – not to detract from the goal but to advance it
Eg. from maternity pay/leave to encouraging men to take paternity leave
Focus on getting men into traditionally female roles (childcare etc)

3. What does success look like?

- 50/50 – gender balance/ parity in: Local and national government, school subjects, business, boards, and across all levels. End to occupational and school subject segregation.
- Shift in the behaviours, career choices, attitudes of men and change in societal expectation of men.
- Reduction in/closing of the gender pay gap
- Shift in what work/roles society values – more men taking shared parental leave.
- Identify, championing and recording of good employers/organisations – who offer flexible working, shared parental leave, balanced work force, balanced board/senior management.
- Engagement with all of society
- Reduction in the number of women (and their children) in poverty
- Gender auditing

Mention of Engenders 'Gender Matters Roadmap' – researched and published action plan which covers education, health, media, employment, social security etc – as a "map" of issues.

ANNEX B

LIST OF CIRCLE ATTENDEES ON 6TH DECEMBER SESSION

Bruce	Adamson	Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland
Rachel	Adamson	Zero Tolerance
Rosemary	Agnew	Scottish Public Services Ombudsman
Safia	Ali	Council of Ethnic Minority Voluntary Sector Organisations
Vikki	Allan	
Carolyn	Anderson	Skills Development Scotland
Shaheen	Baber	Police Scotland
Alice	Beeby	Arts and Business Scotland
Lisa	Bennett	Scottish Children's Reporter Administration
Petra	Biberbach	PAS
Sandy	Brindley	Rape Crisis Scotland
Jackie	Brock	Children in Scotland
Morven	Brooks	Disability Equality
Rachael	Brown	Cultural Enterprise Office
Catherine	Cassidy	Scottish Ballet
Tanya	Castell MBE	Changing the Chemistry
Chloe	Chambrud	Business in the Community
Maggie	Chapman	Scottish Council on Visual Impairment
Kate	Christie	Cairngorms National Park Authority
marie	christie	Events Scotland
Michael	Cross	Scottish Funding Council
Audrey	Cumberford	West College Scotland
Alex	CUmming	Duke of Edinburgh Award Scotland
Eve	Dallas-Childs	The Robertson Trust
Naira	Dar	University of West of Scotland
Anni	Donaldson	University of Strathclyde
Sylvia	Douglas	MsMissMrs
Heather	Dunk	Ayrshire College
Alison	Evison	CoSLA
Rahnuma	Feist-Hassan	Hollaback! Edinburgh
Rose	Fitzpatrick	Police Scotland
Fiona	Garven	Scottish Community Development Centre
Rose	Harkness	South Lanarkshire College
Juliet	Harris	Together Scotland
Ann	Hayne	
Layla	Hill	YonAfro Collective
Claire	Houghton	Edinburgh University
Ruth	Inglis	Scottish Courts and Tribunal Service
Sue	John	Glasgow Women's Library
Lorna	Johnston	Standards Commission for Scotland
Tiffany	Kane	Common Weal

SallyAnn	Kelly	Aberlour
Peter	Kelly	Poverty Alliance
Meryl	Kenny	University of Edinburgh
Monica	Lennon	Monica Lennon
Kim	Long	Councillor
Elaine	Lorimer	Revenue Scotland
Jim	MacDonald	Architecture and Design Scotland
Michelle	Macleod	HM Chief Inspector of Prosecution in Scotland
Jan	Macleod	Tomorrows Women
Ciara	Maguire	Glasgow Pride
Rhona	Matheson	Starcatchers
Nikki	McAulay	Scottish Water
Mhairi	McCann	British Science Association's CREST Youth Panel
karyn	mccluskey	Community Justice
Cheryl	McCreadie	Equate Scotland
Nicola	McEwen	ESRC Centre on Constitutional Change
Diane	McGiffen	Audit Scotland
Mhairi	McGowan	ASSIST
Susie	McKain	Skills Development Scotland
Ben	McKendrick	Scottish Youth Parliament
Joanna	McLaughlin	VAW Network
Linda	McTavish	New College Lanarkshire
Lucy	McTernan	SCVO
Teresa	Medhurst	Scottish Prison Service
Anne	Meikle	Women's Enterprise Scotland
Denise	Millar	Scottish Canals
Caroline	Monk	Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator
Suzanne	Munday	Minority Ethnic Carers of People Project
Rosheen	Murray	
Beldina	Odenyo	Singer and Songwriter
Veronica	O'Halloran	University of Strathclyde?
Lesley	Orr	
Catriona	Patterson	Creative Carbon Scotland
Lauren	Pennycook	Carnegie Trust Scotland
Jennifer	Porteous	
Judith	Robertson	Scottish Human Rights Commission
Denise	Rooney	Fire and Rescue
Peter	Scott	Independent Living Fund
Marsha	Scott	Scottish Women's Aid
denise	spence	Girlguiding Scotland
Jules	Stapleton Barnes	LGBT Healthy Living Centre
Selina	Stephen	Improvement Consultant
Neil	Stevenson	Scottish Legal Complaints Commission
Kirsty	Strickland	Columnist and commentator
First Name	Surname	Organisation
Celia	Tennant	Inspiring Scotland

Alice	Thompson	Social Bite
linda	thompson	Tomorrows Women
sarah	thoms	Equality Human Rights Commissioner
Bill	Thomson	Public Appointments Commissioner
Agnes	Tolmie	Scottish Women's Convention
Carrie	Urquhart	Scottish Natural Heritage
Donna	Very	Water Industry Commission for Scotland
Alison	Wales	NSPCC
Evelyn	Walker	Digital Education Consulting
Isla	Whateley	Girlguiding and Belfast Pride 2017 Leader/Supervisor
Natalie	White	Women in Education in Scotland
Margaret	Young	Women for Independence
Alison	McGregor	HSBC
Kate	Nevans	Amnesty International Scotland (interim Prog Director)